



Public Service Commission
of Canada

Commission de la fonction publique
du Canada

METROPOLIS
Conversation Series 8
**Foreign Credential Recognition &
Federal Public Service Employment**

Ottawa
January 24, 2003

For additional copies please contact:

Metropolis Project Team
365 Laurier Ave. West
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 1L1

or visit:

<http://www.canada.metropolis.net>

Available in French and English.

THE METROPOLIS CONVERSATION SERIES

Since its beginnings in 1996, the Metropolis Project has created a formidable network of policy professionals and scientific researchers drawn from governments, universities, inter-governmental organizations, think tanks, and non-governmental agencies here in Canada and in over twenty other countries. This network has greatly enlarged the body of knowledge and expertise available to policy and program development experts, has increased sensitivity amongst academics to the needs of government and inter-governmental bodies, and has led to more productive relations with NGOs.

With the maturation of the Project, we are now able to deploy a more powerful policy-research “tool” in our efforts to improve the management of the profound changes wrought by migration and growing diversity. We intend to increase the power of our debates and our discussions through a series of small and highly focused conference workshops. Our experience leads us to believe that the **Metropolis Conversation Series** will prove to be of significant value, especially to those grappling with policy challenges of immediate concern.

Eschewing traditional means of transferring knowledge from researcher to decision-maker, Metropolis, in this new series of events, creates settings in which senior policy makers and leading researchers can, in complete confidence, engage one another, explore situations or problems, challenge assumptions and probe each others’ expertise, all to advance the policy process and to create the basis for solutions in practice.

The gatherings are small, in the order of fifteen to twenty people, with the participants carefully chosen with the client to effectively meet the task at hand, be it managing the pressures of immigration on social services; managing the public’s acceptance of immigrants and persons of diverse ethnic origins; determining the impact of immigration on social cohesion, on education, on national or local job markets, on housing and neighbourhood development, on trade, on local development, on crime, and so on. Each Conversation is a closed and highly focused meeting promoting candid face-to-face exchanges among individuals who share common interests.

Through the Conversation Series, we are able to bring together a body of expertise that can address strategic interests and discuss issues of importance from a variety of vantage points. Academics from the four Metropolis Centres of Excellence in Canada and from research institutes around the world specializing in migration and ethnic studies can be brought to the discussions, as can policy makers from all levels in Canada and abroad. The Metropolis Conversation Series is a powerful and easy way to take advantage of the network that the Metropolis Project has created. Not only will participants will be able to work intensively with members of this network drawn from fifteen of Canada’s leading universities, from organizations such as UNESCO, the European Commission, the Asia-Pacific Migration Research Network, and the International Organization for Migration, but they will be able to develop lasting relations with these organizations for the future.

How to contact us

To plan a session in the Metropolis Conversation Series, to identify or articulate substantive issues, to develop a roster of participants, to commission background papers, to develop the format of the session, and to discuss follow-up, please contact:

Howard Duncan
Executive Head
Metropolis Project
365 Laurier Ave West, 18th floor
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 1L1
Tel: 613 957-5916, Fax: 613 957-5968
howard.duncan@cic.gc.ca

Foreign Credentials Recognition and Federal Public Service Employment

CONVERSATION REPORT

Table of Contents:

1) Introduction	1
2) Acknowledgements	1
3) CONVERSATION TOPIC	
a. The National Context	2
b. The Call from government	3
c. Positioning the PSC's Interest in Skills Recognition	4
d. Expected Benefits for the PSC	5
e. Methodology	5
4) ACCOUNT OF CONVERSATION	
a. Recognizing foreign credentials and skills (human capital) of immigrants in the FPS	6
b. Role of the key players	12
c. Support, Mentoring, Programs and Services	18
d. Investments, Partnerships, Next Steps	22
5) About Metropolis	24
6) Appendix	25
7) Bibliography	27

1) Introduction

On January 24, 2003, the Metropolis Project Team hosted a Conversation sponsored by the Public Service Commission (PSC) on the Accreditation of Immigrants within the Federal Public Service. The daylong conversation took place in Ottawa, bringing together academics, researchers, public servants and community leaders to discuss the PSC's goals of recruitment and representativeness in the Public Service. The workshop sought to:

- establish new strategic alliances with universities and research institutes and to improve research partnership within the federal Public Service;
- ensure that Metropolis' research centres continue to produce policy-oriented research of interest to the PSC, and;
- enhance the PSC position in the area of development of a sound strategy to facilitate skilled immigrants in their field of expertise that is essential for the FPS as employer of choice for Canadians.

In order to achieve these objectives, the conversation followed the *Chatham House Rule* which allowed free speech and confidentiality to govern the conversation. This facilitated an engaging debate and the presentation of concrete solutions and suggestions to help the PSC fulfill its mandate. The first part of this document includes background to the conversation including the national context; the government's commitment to the recognition of immigrant skills and credentials; and, the important role the PSC plays in fulfilling this commitment. This information was distributed to participants prior to the Conversation. The second part of this document is a thematic summary of the discussion that took place, presented in a way that ensures that all points of view are included. Some of the statements may contradict each other, however this is a reflection of the diverse opinions of the participants. The statements in this document do not necessarily reflect the opinion of the PSC or the Metropolis Project. Finally, a short description of Metropolis is included.

2) Acknowledgements

This Conversation was organized by Doug Booker and Nabila Abou-Najm of the Public Service Commission and by Jean Viel and Noëlla Nincevic of the Metropolis Project Team. Sandra Lopes served as a notetaker.

3) Conversation Topic: Recognition of Immigrants' Credentials and Federal Public Service Employment

a) National Context

Within today's global economy, skilled immigrants have become a sought after resource. The need to attract and retain immigrant skills is a growing factor that is shaping government priorities and policies. Across borders there is heightened competition for high levels of immigrant skills to improve economic performance (Salt and McLaughlan, 2002, Industry Canada, 2002). Canada's ability to remain competitive in the global economy will depend on how effective it is in developing, attracting and maintaining the skills required for a knowledge-based economy. As skilled immigrants are increasingly in competitive demand, it is imperative that Canada find ways to employ effectively their skills in the Canadian market.

In Canada, demographic factors are a key factor in driving the demand for increased immigration to meet projected labour market needs. It has been widely reported that Canada's population is aging, and its fertility rates are decreasing (Foot: 1998:7-18, Alboim, 2002). By the year 2011, it is estimated that 100% of Canada's net labour force growth will depend on immigration (Alboim, 2002). With respect to labour market forecasting, the aging population is coupled with a low fertility rate, further intensifying the impact of the future labour market.

Over the past decade, Canada received over 2 million immigrants. Many immigrants arriving to Canada today are highly educated and skilled individuals. In fact, the Canadian immigration system gives more points to immigrants with high levels of education and skills. Nearly half of the immigrants accepted into Canada enter as "independents" or "skilled workers", yet many cannot gain entry into the professions or trades for which they hold foreign credentials. As Canada admits more migrants, the country needs to ensure that the appropriate mechanisms are in place to facilitate their integration into the labour force at levels which are appropriate to their competence and training (Huggins, 1997).

Upon their arrival to the host country, most immigrants - skilled, unskilled and professional- seek recognition of their past training, experience and educational attainment achieved outside their new home. Information, institutional and attitudinal barriers exist at all stages of the immigrant accreditation process. At the outset of their immigration experience, poor information on accreditation procedures is the first major barrier to be faced. When immigrant professionals arrive to Canada, they discover:

- there is no national body responsible for the recognition of foreign degrees, professional accreditation and licensing;
- Canadian professional associations, that are the sole "accreditors" within the Canadian system, often lack the necessary information on both education systems abroad and work experience equivalencies;
- educational and occupational standards vary by province and occupational characteristics of the labour market (Mata, 1999).

In addition to this, immigrants face numerous barriers to employment:

- Lack of consistency across Canada in recognition of educational and professional credentials.
- Employer demands for “Canadian experience”.
- Discrimination and/or racism in hiring practices.
- Language needs and understanding of cultural environment and communication.

As a consequence of these barriers, many immigrant qualifications go unrecognized and underutilized in the labour market. The non-recognition of foreign credentials limits the capacity of immigrants to fully participate in and contribute to the labour force and Canadian society more broadly. This leads to a decline in social capital and also results in under-utilization of skills, which in turn affects productivity and economic growth. This often leads to a decrease or lack in the recognition of immigrants’ professional credentials which leads to their underemployment and reduced income levels. The result is that these talented people often crowd the bottom of the income ladder. As a consequence of these barriers, one major socio-economic outcome occurs: a large number of highly qualified immigrant professionals who are under- employed or unemployed (Livingstone, 2002:48; Reitz, 2001) are on welfare assistance or perform low-income menial types of work. The Conference Board of Canada recently concluded that immigrants are among those that experience the most serious problems in achieving recognition in their learning.

Due to the increasing international mobility of labour, issues associated with the recognition of the qualifications of new arrivals are paramount in the social policy agenda of many receiving countries. The problem of the non-recognition of educational and professional credentials brought by immigrants has profound implications in terms of labour market adjustment, and the socio-economic integration of immigrants. It also has an impact on the overall economic well-being of the country, as noted in a recent Conference Board study which indicated that under-employment costs the country 4 to 6 billion dollars annually (Conference Board: 2001).

As a country, we have been successful in attracting educated and skilled immigrants in the past, but we can and need to do a better job of integrating immigrants and helping them achieve their full potential. Allowing immigrants to use their education and skills to the maximum potential is critical because, in the next decade, newcomers will likely account for all of Canada's labour-force growth.

b) The Call from the Government

The issue of foreign credentials is a pressing one, and it is on the federal agenda of our nation. In the 2002 *Speech from the Throne*, the government promised that it would work with its partners to break down barriers to the recognition of foreign credentials and would fast-track those skilled workers who enter Canada with jobs already waiting for them. The government is also committed to making Canada a destination of choice for talented foreign students and skilled workers by more aggressively selecting and recruiting through universities and in key embassies abroad.

c) Positioning the PSC's Interest in the Recognition of Credentials

The Public Service Commission's interest in the issue of credentials recognition relates to the federal Public Service as an employer and a competitor for talent in the broader Canadian labour market. Under the Public Service Employment Act (PSEA), the PSC is responsible for the appointment of qualified persons to and within the Public Service in about 80 different occupational groups (see Appendix), spanning an equal number of federal departments and agencies. The PSC carries out an exclusive responsibility developing and administering processes, as well as establishing standards for selection and assessment with respect to appointments in the federal Public Service.

In a labour market that will increasingly be composed of workers with foreign education and experience, it is essential for the Public Service Commission and the federal Public Service to have an accurate understanding and evaluation of skills, knowledge and experience of foreign-trained workers. As a major employer, the federal Public Service must be more active in understanding and defining issues related to the recognition of foreign credentials to ensure that the federal Public Service can compete for this talent.

While the issue of recognition may currently seem remote from the pressing HR issues of the federal Public Service, the increasing importance of immigrant workers in the labour market means that this issue will continue to grow as the Public Service looks to replace its aging core of baby boomers. Accreditation is of specific importance to the Public Service Commission because of the responsibility the PSC has over selection standards. Currently, the Public Service Commission of Canada limits its involvement in this issue by directing potential applicants to contact an external agency, such as the International Credential Evaluation Service, that offers assessment services for a fee.

The Public Service, as an employer, is prepared to take advantage of the skills, experiences and educational qualifications offered by the immigrant population. In the conversation, we will discuss the issues that must be considered in order to accomplish this objective. The two main questions that we propose to examine are: What role can the PSC (as a recruiter and staffing agency) and the federal Public Service (as an employer), play in the area of the recognition of foreign education, skills, experience and knowledge; and how can the PSC and the federal Public Service, better position themselves to compete for talent in a future labour market that will increasingly be composed of workers with foreign-based experience and education? For the PS to become the employer of choice and be in a better position to attract and retain employees coming to Canada with the desired skill, the PSC must have the necessary policies, programs and services in place to attract the best and the brightest to fill the labour shortages that will occur in the near future.

The purpose of this conversation is to openly discuss recognition of credentials and skills issues from the PS point of view, and to generate solutions and develop program development ideas that will help the PS attract, recruit and retain immigrants who are trained abroad. We hope to

explore how a more cohesive system can be established to improve the access for immigrants, who have foreign experience and educational credentials, into the FPS.

d) Expected Benefits for the PSC

The outcomes of this accreditation conversation will help:

1. To expand the policy and research capacity on issues related to workforce representativeness and diversity within the FPS.
2. To enhance research/policy collaboration, networks and partnerships within all levels of government.
3. To enhance the competitive position of the FPS in the labour market through more effective recruitment and retention strategies.
4. To develop productive collaborations with multistakeholders to ensure the integration of the PSC agenda and mandate.

e) Methodology

The “Conversation” workshop team was composed of research directorate staff and other stakeholders within the PSC. The workshop team reviewed existing practices and prepared an overview of key issues to stimulate workshop discussion.

4) ACCOUNT OF CONVERSATION

Recognition of Skills and Credentials of Immigrant Workers and the Future of Recruitment within the Federal Public Service

a) Recognizing foreign credentials and skills (human capital) of immigrants in the Federal Public Service

Differentiating between key terms and processes

The first part of the discussion revolved around defining the barriers immigrants face in the Public Service and in the labour market more generally. To do this, distinctions were made between regulated and unregulated occupations; between formal and informal credentials; and, between assessing skills and assessing credentials. The regulated occupations include those occupations that require official certification or membership in a professional association for practise in Canada (e.g. doctors). Unregulated occupations include those professions that do not have such requirements. Formal credentials are those degrees, diplomas...etc. that have been given by an institution in another country. Informal credentials are work experiences or skills that cannot be verified with an institution. There seemed to be a consensus that informal credentials and unregulated professions provide the biggest challenge to recognizing immigrant skills in the Public Service. Assessing credentials is a process by which formal credentials are verified (sometimes directly with an institution in another country), and compared to Canadian equivalents. Although credentials should reflect skills, they sometimes do not. Credential Assessment (or Credential Evaluation) usually refers to verifying and evaluating credentials, not evaluating skills or competency.

Other issues were presented relating to these distinctions.

- Accreditation usually applies to the approval of academic programs at institutions, but not to assessing credentials.
- When evaluating a degree, the level, scope, intent of the program, date degree awarded, the institution, what the program intends for its students to achieve (what it trains you for) are compared. The information is collected in a database to facilitate future inquiries.
- Unfortunately, the credibility of evaluation services may be tenuous because if an employee doesn't work out, the evaluation of the credentials might be blamed, not the individual's specific characteristics.
- There has to be a clear distinction between services. Credential evaluation organizations do not advise on competency – only, for example, on educational comparisons. The service has determined that the individual's degrees are valid and to the level required, but the “goodness” of the employee has not been evaluated. Also, language is not part of the evaluation, although the service can tell you the language of instruction. There is a growing demand for a bundled service that provides both language and educational evaluation.

- It isn't just a matter of an assessment being done, but that this assessment is recognized by potential employers. When individuals approach a service for an evaluation of their credentials, it is because they believe that employers will recognise the analysis. When an employer does not believe the assessment because they don't understand the education system of the person, or do not value a degree earned outside of the country, the assessment loses value. Sometimes people think that if the immigrant hasn't taken the exact courses that the degree is too different. (This can sometimes be a problem between provinces.) The situation is more complex to a regulator because they are looking for competency more than education equivalency.
- There is an increasing demand for evaluation services and a growing number of referrals of these services. This suggests that employers are happy with the service. However, judging competency is more difficult because there isn't necessarily a correlation between formal credentials and actual skills.
- We need to establish whether we are evaluating skills or credentials. There is a distinction between the two. Credentials should reflect skills, but they sometimes don't. Running standardized tests might be a better method of revealing skills since credentials are only an approximation of the skills.
- A lot of the focus is usually on the recognition of credentials, but that is the easier problem to solve. It is only one factor that goes into hiring. Internationally trained individuals get treated like recent graduates because employers do not recognize their experience. The focus needs to be on recognizing experience not just recognizing credentials.
- Not every job requires certification; there is an informal sector where jobs do not require it. A lot of immigrants see themselves as overqualified and will downgrade their own credentials to get these jobs because they fear they will be rejected because of their extra skills and credentials.
- Another issue to consider is whether you need to have formal qualifications to do a particular job. Do you need local recognition of the credentials or is it good enough that we accept the foreign diploma? What does the Public Service require?
- In the Canadian population, there is a very small percentage –only about 20 -- that work in regulated professions. But in immigrant groups, the number of people wishing to enter regulated professions is higher –about 40 percent. In the Public Service, the majority of occupations are unregulated professions. One approach the Public Service could take is to encourage immigrants to redirect their careers into unregulated professions. On the other hand, the government has an opportunity to deal with issues relating to informal recognition.
- Evaluators that had to make general statements about 700 equivalencies from 10 countries would reveal that in 65-70% of cases the education was deemed equivalent.

About 50% at BA level, 90% at PHD, 85% of doctors and others with a professional degree. On average the more specialized or the higher the degree, the more likely it is to be equivalent to the degree granted here. This is consistent with marketplace practices that are more likely to discount a BA education than a PHD foreign credential.

- In terms of the regulated versus non-regulated professions dilemma, the difficulty for the Public Service will be in the non-regulated employment areas.
- In general, we know what we should do about the formal skills and regulated professions –the question is how. However, the informal qualifications are more difficult. They often depend on labour market outcomes.
- In terms of informal qualifications (i.e. work experience) countries differ in their approach. In the U.S any work experience gained outside of the country is not recognized. In Europe, this is an unacceptable position. In the EU, most requests for validating the informal qualification of immigrants come from the private sector.
- Although recognizing immigrant skills that fulfill market shortages is important, more significant is the 80-90 percent of people who are competing in areas where there are large numbers of native-born workers with growing educational qualifications. There is presently no bureaucratic framework that requires we consider immigrant born qualifications. Equal opportunity regulations created large human resource departments. The federal bureaucracy, with its large HR, might be in a good position to deal with these credential evaluation and recognition issues.

Barriers to foreign credentials and skills recognition in the FPS

There were several barriers to foreign credentials and skills recognition that were identified. These included language skills, racism, cost and/or time needed for credential evaluation.

- Refugees may not have the required documents for assessment.

Language

- An important question needs to be considered: What about language issues? Even if someone has the necessary credentials, if they are not competent in French or English, they may not be able to practice their profession. For some careers, linguistic ability is paramount. (i.e. Psychiatrist)
- The “language problem” can sometimes mean communication between employer and employee is difficult. Employers do not give their immigrant employees the opportunities to use their skills, so these individuals are indirectly not recognised. On the other hand, immigrant employees know the language at a basic level, but not how to express themselves in relationship to their skills.

- In the Public Service, it is important to maintain essential services in both official languages (Official Languages Act). Linguistic duality is a pillar of Canadian Society. Working in the Public Service, individuals must have ability to communicate in at least one of the official languages.
- In the EU, a person cannot be discriminated against because of their language skills unless public authorities can prove that language skills are necessary to the job. The onus of proof is not on the individual seeking recognition but on the public.

Racial Discrimination

- Credentials are always being evaluated, sometimes by criteria not related to the skills the credentials should reflect. A non-white person and/or woman's credentials would not have the same value as a white male. The features of the holders of the credentials are sometimes intentionally or unintentionally considered even when it doesn't make sense to do so. It always happens, not just in the hiring process, but when it comes time to offer promotions.
- There is a perception that immigrants from some countries are only qualified for some positions. For example, the vast majority Chinese immigrants hold degrees in the sciences and there is a perception that Chinese people are only good employees as technicians not as managers. Because of a fear that they will not be given the opportunity, many immigrants do not apply to management positions. It is important to recognize that immigrants choose where they apply based on their perceived chances of success. It is important to get people into management.
- We need to recognize that the problems associated with immigrants in the labour force is not just a credential recognition issue. It is discrimination. We need to call it what it is because the public doesn't acknowledge that discrimination exists. In order to address racial discrimination, we need to acknowledge it. It includes stereotyping people with certain qualifications.
- A system of formally evaluating credentials is good because it removes the rationale for discrimination. However, it is important to recognize that immigrants are penalized (when income outcomes are considered) no matter where they were educated. We also need to recognize that credential recognition will benefit some groups more than others.
- Immigrants perceive their skills as being overlooked.

Time and Cost Constraints for Immigrants and Managers

- The time it takes for immigrants to enter the workforce is relevant to this discussion, because recent research published by provincial Ontario government found that the longer an individual delays entering into their occupation of interest, the harder it

becomes to do so. In this way, giving priority for jobs in the Public Service to Canadians creates a long delay for immigrants wishing to enter the Public Service. The citizenship process can take up to three years. This means these individuals are waiting for this opportunity, possibly becoming deskilled. However, a recent Supreme Court decision (*Lavoie v. Canada*) upheld the Public Service's citizenship requirement.

- Because the hiring practise is basically unregulated, the cost of getting the wrong person is high. Even in a contract situation there is a commitment of time and resources by the employer. Employers mitigate all unknown factors, and thus choose people with credentials that they are comfortable with –often similar to their own.
- Currently, when someone goes to the Public Service Commission looking for a job that requires formal certification, they are required to get their credentials evaluated before applying. This is a process that puts onus on the individual. Does it provide a barrier, financial or otherwise?
- Some employers in other sectors are willing to pay for the evaluation process if the skills held by the immigrant applicant are in demand. However, in most cases the employer won't consider the individual until the evaluation process has been completed. More important than the financial barriers posed by the evaluation process, is the need to deal with the recognition factor. Employers need to be comfortable that the accreditation is accurate and they must recognize the skills that are acquired in other countries.

Overcoming the barriers associated with recognizing the skills and credentials of immigrants.

The discussion suggested that the Public Service could learn from the experiences of other countries and that addressing the barriers faced by immigrants required an approach that encompassed more than just credential recognition. It was acknowledged that the Public Service has the potential and mandate to address these important issues.

- Credential evaluation is necessary because of its use as a proxy to represent certain abilities by regulators in practising occupations, and for determining what training opportunities should be offered to the individual. But credential recognition is not sufficient. There are three other issues. Firstly, language skills need to be evaluated, but this evaluation needs to be occupation-specific. Secondly, the competencies that have been achieved though work experience in other countries needs to be recognized. Thirdly, the immigrant employee needs an understanding of the Canadian context, including the legislative framework under which Canadians operate. These four issues raise a question about how much of this has to happen before, and how much can happen after the individual is hired? Some regulators may require that the individual meet all requirements, but in some cases training and/or testing can be done after a job has been offered. Although a immigrant employee may require credential recognition, language evaluation, recognition of their work experience, and an understanding of the Canadian context, perhaps not all of these requirements need to be met before a job offer is

extended. A minimum could be established with the intention that some of the four issues will be addressed later.

- The experiences of Filipino nurses provide an example of the problems associated with the four issues previously identified. Language testing is not specific to the nursing profession, but is a prerequisite for practicing. For example, what do questions about sports have to do with nursing? However, the problems that Filipino nurses face also demonstrate a link between immigration policies, state cutbacks to services and underemployed immigrants. In the 1970s Canada recruited nurses from the Philippines as nurses. There was a system in place to help these women and men practise their profession. However, now nurses from the Philippines (often women) have to come to Canada as domestic workers. As a domestic worker, these women must work as domestic workers for 24 months. This delays the practise of their skills, and sometimes postpones it so much that these women need refresher courses to practice in Canada. Non-profit organizations have been helping Filipino nurses make the transition into the Canadian labour market, and have developed information packages about how to go through the licensing process.
- The government could remove the citizenship requirement for Public Service jobs through legislation.
- Once employed by the Public Service, the wage gap between minorities and other individuals is lower than in other sectors. This suggests that the Public Service is doing something right once minorities are hired.
- If the Public Service is interested in advancing this cause, it will have to separate the evaluation of credentials/skills from the hiring process. An offer of conditional employment, might be a way to overcome some barriers to employment. The Public Service could do some internal research about the performance of individuals with different credentials to develop a knowledge base that would prevent mistakes in hiring and improve the process.
- The Public Service has an advantage over other employers because it has the authority to establish centralized programming that does not devolve the hiring risk to each of the departments. It can create probationary periods, assessments, language training and create internships targeting immigrants and then assign individuals to departments. Contract positions are an acceptable method because it is becoming a standard practice—even overqualified people have to have contract positions now.
- There is a danger when establishing special hiring programs for immigrants that you are favouring immigrants over the native-born.
- The demographic challenge suggests that in 10 years the Public Service won't have enough Canadian applicants. Assumptions about how programs “favouring” immigrants will be perceived will be irrelevant.

b) Roles of the key players

Key players including the Public Service as an employer, managers, immigrant employees and government were identified and their roles debated. In particular the benefits and constraints of centralized versus decentralized approaches to hiring in the Public Service and testing versus credential evaluation were debated. Many participants suggested that the Public Service Commission could play an important role training managers and promoting awareness of the issues within the Public Service.

Public Service as an Employer

- The Public Service needs a system review of employment equity policies and practices. What are the Public Service's hiring practices and selection criteria? Do they have any unintended consequences? For example, is constant eye contact, which is supposed to reflect confidence and leadership ability, difficult for some immigrant groups from countries where eye contact is discouraged? The research has never looked at the immigrant's experience in the hiring process at the Public Service.
- The Federal Public Service has possibilities and advantages to move beyond a gatekeeping role and move toward safekeeping role. This could mean more focus on developing and retaining immigrants. Although as it is, once people have been placed into departments it is the department's responsibility to ensure development and fairness, the Federal Public Service could play a role in centralized planning and decentralized implementation.
- The Public Service Commission acts as a gatekeeper. It does this to respond to its clients, and credentials are only one of the issues used to filter people. And issues affecting immigrants do not always reflect an "either or" situation. Language for example, is not a dichotomy –people have language skills in degrees. Also, an individual might speak one of the official languages well, but with a thick accent. Their skills could be discounted for hiring or promotion depending on the thickness of their accent. The affect that something like this has on the hiring process is difficult to measure.
- Another issue to address is the extent to which assessment and analysis of foreign skills and credentials can be delegated to others, how much of it should be centralized and paid by the Public Service Commission, or in partnership with others who may also benefit from this process.
- Canada removed the occupational dimension of their immigration process because they acknowledged that there was no guarantee that these individuals would be able to practice their profession in Canada. In Australia however, a different approach was taken. Instead of getting rid of the occupational dimension, Australia would test people outside the country to ensure that they could practice in Australia. Potential immigrants are also asked to write an English and sometimes an occupational test. There has been major improvement in labour market outcomes. It is expensive to do this, but the payoff in

terms of added economic performance has made this a worthwhile experiment. Australia receives large numbers of Commonwealth Asians because they score well on the tests due to their English language abilities.

- In Germany an IT green card follows a similar method of recruitment.
- Canada recognizes educational achievements, but does not consider whether that education will be recognized in Canada.
- Alberta did go to the Philippines in search of qualified nurses to fulfill the demand in that province.
- Perhaps, recruitment of professionals in their country of origin is something that can be done in areas where there is an acute market need, instead of across the board.

Promote awareness of the issue

- The Public Service Commission has a potentially important role to play. It can raise awareness of the demographic issue and explain how this issue will affect the Public Service and the labour market. The government needs strong champions of this issue at the senior level –elected and non-elected – to develop a solid business case.
- The Canadian educated population is providing the Public Service with the most incredibly qualified and educated applicants. The Public Service has more PhDs than ever before. Only recently however, has the Public Service recognized that it will be facing a demographic challenge. The need to address this challenge must be recognized within the Public Service.
- Changing attitudes is important, and shouldn't be downplayed.
- Certain myths need to be addressed in and out of the Public Service Commission. The myth that visible minorities are not really interested in a career in the Public Service needs to be dispelled. It has been proved wrong. A career fair for visible minorities and disabled people had over 7000 participants, more than twice the number that what was expected. And the quality of the candidates was high. Another myth is that visible minorities are not interested in managerial positions. But studies suggest that they are more interested, and more qualified than other public servants.

Training and Sensitizing Managers and Others in the Hiring process

- At the centralized level, you can develop strategies to increase managers' competencies to deal with immigrants and other groups. It makes no sense to work on recruiting people just to have them quit.
- Selection boards are trained and becoming increasingly diverse. This can mitigate the problem posed by thick accents.
- Training people about how to make hiring decisions would be a useful skill –not just a way to hire more immigrants. It is difficult to identify skills as they relate to education, experience, and communication. For example, how do you identify language and team skills? Because of the difficulties involved, often employers will choose the least risky – that is –that which they are familiar with. Also, getting employers to recognise education is relatively simple, attitudinal and behavioural difficulties are the real problems.
- Although it may be easier to make credential assessments if people have the proper documents, even if a person has their documents assessed managers might not feel that training in this part of the world is equivalent (even if they have studies to improve it). Credential recognition is more than just a system, it needs to change people's attitudes. We need to challenge management to take risks. We don't recognise racial discrimination because we don't talk about it –it is only the residual, assumed problem. Government is a good place to work, but the onus is on immigrants to know how the system works and how to enter the Public Service.

Centralized v. decentralized approaches

- Managers want to get a person hired as quickly as possible. They want: basic knowledge, mandate of organisation, ability to write a briefing note, a spreadsheet test... etc. HR has the time and the inclination to do this testing. We need top-down motivation for change of behaviour. We also need knowledge and research is necessary, although we may know enough to proceed in certain directions.
- We need to move to a centralized system of hiring if we want a representative Public Service. Immigrants usually don't have any contact people who are in HR and this therefore puts them at a disadvantage.

Skills Testing v. Credential Evaluation

- To hire talent and identify skills you have two methods: you can believe a credential or you test thoroughly. In Canada, because of a uniform university system, Canadians could trust the credentials of their applicants. (a BA from any university would give the individual similar skills) However, in the US, where universities vary significantly in terms of quality, there is more emphasis on testing. There is a demand for high-level

skills and people bring their qualifications from around the world. Does it matter that the university is in China, or is it time to realise that we need to do throughout testing? Are we going to test people or assess people? What are the costs and benefits to each option?

- Doing more testing might benefit the Public Service, but there has been more emphasis recently on downsizing hiring responsibilities to managers.
- Public Service Commission research that looks at appointment rates and vehicles used to enter the Public Service suggests that comprehensive tests provide more equitable outcomes than hiring managers. If we look at recruitment through comprehensive tests that are relatively non-biased –application rates are an estimated 25-30 per cent almost across the board for minorities. The success rates through appointments are an estimated 20-25 per cent. When hiring managers recruit, only an estimated 10 per cent of people hired are minorities. Although discrimination is not said to exist, something must be going on to create these discrepancies. We must know why, and address the discrimination. It is important to deal with these discrepancies because there is likely to be more delegation to managers in the future.
- In the Dutch public service, testing is done to get a reserve list. It is at that stage that accreditation becomes important. Managers are then choosing from a pool of applicants.
- At the Canadian Public Service we have a pre-qualified pool at the executive level.
- Any method that would standardise the procedure would remove the arbitrariness. Tests can reveal skills in native-born Canadians too.
- My concern is that employers will use standardised testing for all their recruitment. But these tests are culturally biased. If we use a standardised test, to do so in a culturally free way, we need to ensure that we are testing only those things that need to be tested. In this way we are removing barriers, not imposing more barriers.

Manager's Role

- We need to transform ownership of these issues, so that managers can be made accountable for those changes.

Immigrant Employee – identifying needs

- There are also some aspects of social capital that immigrants may lack. For example, as hiring in the Public Service becomes more decentralized, connections and networking becomes more important. If immigrants don't have a network in the Public Service, or networking opportunities, they may be at a disadvantage. In terms of networking, it is a question of degree: how much does not having a network jeopardise an immigrant's opportunities?

- Visible minorities tend to discover Public Service job opportunities through the Internet. This mitigates against networking problems and reiterates the importance of e-recruitment initiative.
- There is a need to promote awareness of Public Service job opportunities to immigrants, especially those outside of Ottawa who may not realize that there are employment opportunities in many other locations.

Government and its Commitment

- In some occupational areas, it is clear from this discussion that we know what to do. The question is: do we want to? We need to question whether or not the government is really committed to this issue. There is sufficient evidence to suggest that credential discrimination is racial discrimination -- that the person who is denied a position or promotion because of their origins is being discriminated against. However, at a Metropolis conference in October, high-ranking officials stated that racial discrimination does not exist. They were so sure of this fact that they didn't want to fund an exploration of the topic. At the National Summit on Innovation and Learning organized by Industry Canada and HRDC, there was no program targeting immigrants.
- The government is committed to this issue. This discussion reflects this commitment. One of the purposes of this meeting is to start developing strategies. At the Metropolis Conference in Edmonton we will have even more opportunity to move this issue forward. Also, the need to address the demographic issue is becoming more recognized.

Other Key Players

Private Sector

- Another issue to address is the extent to which assessment and analysis of foreign skills and credentials can be delegated to others, how much of it should be centralized and paid by the Public Service Commission, or in partnership with others who may also benefit from this process.

Immigration Officials

- Immigration rules need to be included in the review process. In the EU the internal market was given immigration rights explicitly in the treaty. The immigration system was pushed by the case law that upheld the right of individuals to entry and their right to practice their professions. Here, immigration has to cater better to the needs of the workforce. The EU experience can also provide examples about spreading information to managers.

- There is currently a divide between immigration requirements and foreign credentials. When “points” are given to immigrants because of their education for example, whether or not this education will be recognized is not included in the process.

NGOs

- NGOs play an important role in helping immigrant communities enter the workforce in their chosen profession. They are doing so without government funding (from HRDC) because (as the argument goes) they often only cater to a particular community. For example, Filipino nurses. But this argument ignores the benefit of having qualified nurses to the broader Canadian community. It also ignores that these Filipino nurses are Canadian too. The important role of NGOs in helping immigrants and the Canadian-born and in conducting research needs to be recognized and financially supported.

c) Support, mentoring, programs and services

Several mentoring initiatives, programs and services were recommended. These projects identified reflected a common sentiment: that the onus for credential evaluation had to shift from the individual immigrant and their communities to the Public Service.

Process used now:

- At an interview with the Public Service, an individual should present their credential assessment. From application to interview getting into the Public Service can take up to 10 months.
- A service can provide a verbal equivalency in minutes if all the documents are in order. But usually an equivalency takes 10 working days but can be up to 8 months if the service is waiting for an institution in another country to respond.
- The Public Service has tools, but we need to set out what we have, what we do with it, and how to improve them to achieve the Public Service's goals.

Services to facilitate credential recognition:

- Whatever is done, the Public Service Commission must avoid bureaucratizing the process. Don't be too rigid. We need to measure competencies according to the jobs, and to recognize that some people work out while others don't. The Public Service needs to support variations/flexibility in a large system.
- The questions around credential evaluation and recognition are complex, but it has been agreed that it can be done. The question is what can be done? How can foreign experience be acknowledged? We need to develop a methodology, concretise this.
- Not only are there several services for doing credential evaluation but most universities and community colleges and many big regulators do their own. Still, many employers don't know about evaluation services. It would not be useful for the Public Service Commission to set up its own. Instead, it could legitimize a company (or companies) by using its services exclusively.
- Universities won't willingly give up their assessment role. How can they be encouraged to go outside their organisation? It might be useful for them to share databanks, create reciprocity agreements with other universities, and participate in joint missions overseas to ensure that there is consistency.
- Universities are in a unique position because they can assess people at a trial level, and they can even lower their original assessment. They can't lose because they receive tuition from the student. Also, universities are in competition with each other for these

students. For universities, the process time is the key issue – they need to process students to get them in by deadlines.

- Immigrant applicants should be invited to get their credentials evaluated, but should also be reassured that the Public Service is interested in hiring them –that their foreign degree will not hinder their chances. Mentioning the evaluation process (depending on how it is done) can be either an incentive or a disincentive.
- There is sometimes a delay involved in getting an assessment done because getting information from an immigrant’s country of origin is difficult. Sometimes an individual has waited until a job is posted to get assessed. Conditional offers could be used to mitigate this problem.
- To solve the problem of acknowledging informal skills, there could be comprehensive competency-based assessment. We have developed biased-free assessment tools and it might be useful to invest some money in tools to assess competencies, especially for refugees (i.e. show us what you can do). These tests can be used for entry-level positions too, not just for immigrants. These tools would go beyond the standardized test because they would demonstrate what potential employees could do in a very real way. For example, sit in front of this computer and show me what you can do. Bow Valley College in Calgary uses some technical tests that are aimed at technical jobs. These tests include assessing skills, security and safety and filling out forms relating to the profession. After they complete the tests they can participate in a course.
- Another possible solution to the barriers we have discussed is bridge training. We could develop very innovative geographic-specific strategies with major local employers. This could take the form of joint training.
- We could also develop work placements to facilitate getting actual experience.
- Internships need to be long enough for adequate training and adjustment to take place. Sometimes interns need to learn a lot, but managers can’t give them the time they need.
- Credential evaluation doesn’t guarantee a job, it just decides the minimum requirement. We need to consider multiple indicators including subjective qualities. The use of a committee, as is used in graduate student recruitment, can mitigate against arbitrary subjective selection because an average opinion can be used.

Outreach

- To promote awareness of the opportunities available within the Public Services, the Internet could reach a lot of people. But another way to reach people is through NGOs, especially to reach refugees.

Services for hiring managers

- Managers could be expected to deliver on Public Service wide goals.
- It is important to monitor the performance of managers, and to include diversity in their evaluation. People are good at responding to reward systems. The Public Service is already going in this direction.

Addressing discrimination

- Racism needs to be acknowledged as part of our culture. It is a cultural practise. To address this we need training for managers who may not be aware that their actions constitute racism; an open and transparent HR policy where decision-makers need to justify why they make the decisions they do; and, decision makers need to justify why they don't hire someone.
- The approach to making people aware of these issues must be positive, not negative. We cannot make the primary message be the discrimination, but instead focus on trying to tap the potential of skilled immigrants. There are lots of people who want to capture these opportunities. Focus groups in the Public Service revealed that although there is a consensus about the principle of representatives, at the level of implementation the consensus unravelled. People know it is important, but not how to implement it.
- Racial discrimination is a Canadian issue that needs to be dealt with. Filipino men and women in the late 60s and early 70s immigrated as professionals and were allowed to practice, but now people are coming in as cheap labour for Canada. People become de-skilled because they are forced to immigrate as domestics. Women, especially, have been segregated into cheap labour. Accreditation is expensive for individuals.
- To deal with attitudinal issues and practices much more training in the workplace and of managers is needed to confront racism. Partnership could be made with the unions, subgroups and workers.
- More resources need to be put into educating managers to recognize their discrimination practices/assumptions, especially if standardized tests have significantly different hiring outcomes.

Support, mentoring and programs once hired.

- Some development programs like career assignment programs within the Public Service feed groups into executive positions and target aboriginal people, people with disabilities, and visible minorities. Large numbers of people from visible minority groups say they wouldn't have bothered applying without this encouragement. Until minority groups achieve a critical mass within the Public Service, the Public Service needs to be far more proactive, and put more resources into this.
- Community groups often provide crucial mentoring for immigrant communities. Within a community there is on-going development of skills, and communities are constantly renegotiating and addressing specific needs. This is sometimes not perceived as mentoring because the information given is culturally specific to the community.
- In the 70s there were good orientation programs available for nurses, but this is not happening now. There is more funding required for on-the-job training and adjustment. There used to be six weeks of work followed by a test. Now after two days a nurse is left on her own. ICU courses used to be given free.
- Once people get into the Public Service, there is a pattern of occupational/horizontal segregation. Minorities are in the IT branches, audit branches, the more technological function branches, instead of the program delivery branches. How do you break down this?
- Before committing to a course of action, the Public Service needs to consider the problems with special programs, in particular how they are perceived. In the Ontario Public Service, there are a lot of entry-level positions held by racial minorities. Mostly in clerical work, but the transition from clerical entry level to program is difficult. There is nothing wrong with developing initiatives for an occupational grouping –for example, from clerical support to program management or from functional to management, so that you can capture everyone in this area. It will happen to benefit minorities more because they are in these areas. This can give people bridging opportunities.
- Once we have hired immigrants, is there a method to help them develop social capital? For example, a network of recent hires, mentors and/or coaches. Women have found these strategies useful.

d) Investments, Partnerships, Next Steps

There was a short discussion about the networks and partnerships that have been created in Europe to address the issues relating to credential recognition but it was agreed that more research was needed before solutions to the problems identified in Canada could be found. Potential research questions were proposed, as was the nature and scope of research projects. Small-scale Canadian comparative research projects with an international component were recommended.

Partnerships with other governments

- Recognizing the credentials of refugees can be difficult since they may not have the necessary documents. In Europe, because countries are sharing information with one another, the special relationships that some countries have with source countries can be used to assist in this process. (For example, the agreements between Afghanistan and France). Networks to share this information in Europe are good because of a legal deadline that ensures that authorities decide on the credentials in a month's time. If no decision is made, the individual's credentials are assumed to be valid.
- In the EU each profession has a centralized body for each member state for each profession. Local agencies get information from a centralized agency and they approve it.

Research

- There is a need for research, especially small projects to determine the specific challenges faced by those entering informal areas, and to determine which areas there is most value-added to focus the Public Service's attention.
- The Public Service could be a leader in promoting employer awareness of the issues surrounding credential recognition. Putting out research that illustrates some of the problems faced by immigrants and minorities can help, as can targeting certain employers, even in the private sector. There is a need for a sensitization campaign.
- We have to engage in research, and devote money to research. It shouldn't be large-scale projects, but experimental, demonstration projects to entice certain departments. We need to articulate a research proposal and develop some connections with the regional office. Say to a region: we would like you to co-operate with researchers in this area and invite competition. Two, three or four projects with a \$25,000 budget might be appropriate.
- The Public Service Commission could also make the data it has been collecting and its own research more accessible to the public.
- At this point we don't need a full-fledged proposal, but a research question and context for that question so teams of smaller groups can develop a proposal. How can the Public Service develop competencies? What mechanisms and costs are associated with this?

- The research could also address the issue of retention. How can we retain people? This research relating to the Public Service could validate studies already done in other areas.
- Possibly develop a program for international credential recognition with a variety of private and public sector partners like Industry Canada, Statistic Canada, Quebec, and foreign researchers. There needs to be some emphasis on the informal sector too.
- It might also be useful to look at private sector companies, like banks who may already be dealing with these issues. What has worked from an organisational and employee perspective? Within the PSC itself: What are the initiatives that have worked? How were these decisions made?
- The Public Service Commission has moved from a rigid staffing system to one that is based on values instead of rules. In the past three years, it has begun reporting to parliament on values and merit and getting parliamentarians to look at the Public Service differently.
- Another question that might be addressed in research: What HR procedures do major employer use? The Canadian Labour Business Centre or Price Water House did research on employer attitudes. Some companies do their own evaluation of skills, and larger employers –especially in IT - are more likely to do so than smaller ones. Sometimes smaller companies have no idea that there is a way to compare at all.
- The research needs to make a clear distinction between visible minorities and immigrants. We don't have a data set of a clear understanding of the differences. Can new census information address this?
- Some research should focus on what is already being done especially in the EU, to determine what could work in the Canadian context. The EU has a very detailed system that is practical, although it is between countries that are very similar in many regards.
- The data from research on the Public Service needs to be disseminated widely.
- As important as the successes in the EU, are its failures. Some countries were reluctant or unable to catch black sheep. Sometimes, the system works in some states, but fails because of national idiosyncrasies or because of failure of communication between member states. On the other hand, Canadians have to be cautious of the EU example, because they have infrastructure and enforcement mechanisms that Canadians don't (especially at the different levels of government.). Also the similarities between EU countries cannot be compared with the difference between Canada and its primary source countries (e.g.: China).

5) About the Metropolis Project

The Metropolis Project was conceived in 1994 and launched in 1996. It was motivated by the recognition that there existed a pressing need to come to grips with the challenges and to capitalize on the opportunities associated with migration and the integration of ethnic and religious minorities in large cities around the world.

The Project was shaped by the understanding that for migration and integration policies to succeed, they would need the active and co-ordinated support of all levels of government, NGOs, the private sector and the public at large. These stakeholders did not lack conviction about the importance of the task. What they lacked was knowledge and, consequently, the ability to operate from a shared strategic platform. In order to address this, the Project was structured in a manner to include all of the key stakeholders.

A second key factor affecting the Project's design was a sharp curtailment in public spending which forced governments everywhere to re-evaluate their priorities and to seek strategic alliances that would rationalise scarce resources and leverage help from other sectors. In the case of policy development, it was recognized that further investments in knowledge were needed and that this knowledge should be obtained through new alliances with universities, research institutes and think tanks. It was felt that by bringing external scientific knowledge to bear on complex, strategic issues that cut across several jurisdictions, more robust public policy would result.

The goal of the Metropolis Project is to improve policies for managing migration and diversity in major cities, and it will do this by:

- enhancing academic research capacity;
- focusing academic research on critical policy issues and policy options; and
- developing ways to facilitate the use of research in decision-making.

The project has been structured as a partnership with both domestic and international components. It seeks to increase the amount of research done in the immigration and diversity fields; to create opportunities for significant interchange among decision-makers, researchers and NGOs; to encourage discussions that go well beyond the mere stating of positions, descriptions, and advocacy; and to provide settings for problem solving using the best information and analysis.

<http://www.metropolis.net>

Appendix

*External Recruitment by Occupational Group: Term and Indeterminate Appointments.
Fiscal Year 2001-2002*

Occupational Group	Indeterminate Appointments	Term Appointments	Total
Agriculture	1		1
Air traffic control	1		1
Aircraft operations Specialist	41	2	43
Architecture and town planning	12	22	34
Administrative services	419	1011	1430
Auditor	11	1	12
Biologist	112	150	262
Career assignment program	5		5
Chemist	18	23	41
Communications	2	9	11
Commerce	155	196	351
Clerical and regulatory	455	6052	6507
Computer systems administration	329	906	1235
Correctional services	278	181	459
Data processing	5	93	98
Drafting and illustration	1	25	26
Defense scientific service	6	45	51
Education	17	132	149
Engineering and scientific support	124	651	775
Electronics	31	46	77
Engineering and land survey	131	144	275
Economist, sociologist and statistician	384	252	636
Executive	55	20	75
Financial administrator	172	118	290
Forestry	2	8	10
Firefighter	2	31	33
Foreign service officer	70	42	112
General labour and trades	113	1079	1192
General services	27	506	533
General technical	74	121	195
General executive		1	1
Heating, power and stationary plant operation	5	27	32
Historical researcher	15	10	25
Hospital services		202	202
Information services	119	281	400
Law	99	174	273
Lighthouse keepers	2	27	29
Library science	10	33	43
Mathematician	31	4	35
Medical Doctor	23	11	34
Management trainee	46	1	47
Meteorologist	21	8	29

External Recruitment by Occupational Group: Term and Indeterminate Appointments.

Fiscal Year 2001-2002

Occupational Group	Indeterminate Appointments	Term Appointments	Total
Nutrition and Dietetics	1	2	3
Nursing	61	345	406
Office equipment Operator	1	7	8
Organization and methods		14	14
Occupational and physical therapy	3	5	8
Physical sciences	39	198	237
Personnel administration	164	165	329
Purchasing and supply	109	61	170
Primary products inspection	12	58	70
Program administration	367	949	1316
Printing operations		6	6
Psychology	22	24	46
Photography	1	1	2
Regulatory enforcement	62	14	76
Radio operation	3	8	11
Ships' crew	6	348	354
Scientific research	34	54	88
SRE Scientific regulation	89	12	101
Social Science support	175	286	461
Ships' officers	31	33	64
Ship repair		57	57
Secretarial, stenographic and typing	131	461	592
Social work	3	4	7
Technical inspection	87	21	108
Translation	134	18	152
University teaching	8	79	87
Veterinary medicine	4	1	5
Welfare programs	50	116	166
Total	5021	15992	21013

Source: PSC Appointments File. 2001-2002 (excluding Canada Customs and Revenue Agency)

Bibliography

- Alboim N. and the Maytree Foundation
Fulfilling the Promise: Integrating Immigrant Skills into the Canadian Economy, Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy. (April 2002).
- Basran, G. and L. Zong
The Devaluation of Foreign Credentials as Perceived by Visible Minority Immigrants in Canada,
 Canadian Ethnic Studies (1998), 30 (3): 6-23.
- Boyd, Monica
Immigration and Occupation Attainment in Canada pp. 393-445 in Monica Boyd, et al. (Eds.) *Ascription and Achievements: studies in Mobility and Status Attainment in Canada*. (1985), Ottawa: Carleton University Press.
- Brouwer, A.
Immigrants Need Not Apply, Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy. (October 1999).
- Conference Board of Canada
Brain Gain: The Economic Benefits of Recognizing Learning and Learning Credentials, (2001). (www.conferenceboard.ca/press/documents/bis-ndp_a.html)
- David K. Foote
Boom, Bust & Echo: Profiting from the Demographic Shift in the New Millennium, (2000), Toronto: Stoddart Publishing Company Ltd.
- Huggins, Nadine
1997 Immigrant Access to Trade Occupations in Ontario: Stakeholders and Initiatives, Conference on Immigration, Employment and Economy. (1997).
- Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC)
Job Futures 2000, World of Work. Ottawa. (2000).
- Industry Canada
Government Innovation Strategy: Achieving Excellence, (January 2002).
- John Salt and Gail McLaughlan
Global Competition for Skills: An Evaluation of Policies, DIMIA Conference: Migration Benefiting Australia. (May, 2002).
- Li, Peter
The Market Worth of Immigrants' Educational Credentials, Canadian Public Policy. (2001), 27 (1): 23-38.
- Livingstone, David
Working and Learning in the Information Age, CPRN. (March 2002).

Mata Fernando

The Non-Accreditation of Immigrants Professionals in Canada: Societal Impacts, Barriers and Present Policy Initiatives the Problem, Department of Canadian Heritage, Multiculturalism Program. (1999).

Open Learning Agency (OLA)

1993 Draft Proposal to Develop the Open learning Agency Credential Evaluation Service (OLACES). OLA. (1993).

Pendakur, Krishna and Ravi Pendakur

The Colour of Money: Earning Differentials Among Ethnic Groups in Canada, Canadian Journal of Economics (1998), 31 (3): 518-548.

Reitz, Jeffrey *Immigrant Skill Utilization in the Canadian Labour Market: Implications of Human Capital Research*, University of Toronto: Center for Industrial Relations and Department of Sociology. (October 2001).