

# Conversation Series

## Labour Market Outcomes for Immigrants

On December 2, 2003, the Metropolis Project Team hosted a Conversation on Labour Market Outcomes for Immigrants, in partnership with Human Resources and Skills Development Canada. The Conversation took place in Ottawa and brought together leading migration economists, Canadian policy makers, and representatives from Canadian think tanks. The aim of the meeting was to contribute to a more informed debate and to provide some practical approaches to assist in making decisions concerning immigration. In order to create a candid, uninhibited exchange of ideas, the format precluded any formal presentations. To achieve an open and frank discussion, the Conversation followed the Chatham House Rule. Participants were free to use the information outside the meeting, but are not to divulge who said what. For this reason, this report does not directly attribute comments made by Conversation participants.

### INTRODUCTION

Immigrants have become an increasingly important part of the Canadian labour market. Currently immigrants account for 70 percent of labour market growth and it is estimated by 2011, immigrants will account for all labour market growth (Statistics Canada, 2003). Although immigrants are becoming an increasingly important component of the labour market, most studies find that the outcomes of recent immigrants have worsened over the past few decades. Empirical evidence has pointed to a trend of declining entry earnings of successive entry cohorts. Further, it has also been found that earnings of recent immigrants may never catch up to those of the Canadian born. Most studies find that more recent immigrant cohorts have not integrated as well as previous cohorts (see Bloom, Grenier and Gunderson (1995), Baker and Benjamin (1994) and Beach and Worswick (1993)). Immigrants entering Canada in the early 1990s have done particularly poorly (Green and Worswick, 2003). Further, low-income rates of immigrants have increased over the past twenty years (Picot and Hou, 2003).

Through these discussions, we hope to determine why immigrants are not succeeding, and what policies may be implemented or changed to improve the labour market outcomes of immigrants. The report follows the order of the discussion. The discussion

#### Metropolis Conversation Series

The Metropolis Conversation Series brings together researchers, public servants, policymakers and community leaders to identify and explore current public policy debates. Conversations are closed-door and highly-focused to promote candid exchanges. The gatherings are small and include carefully selected people who share common interests, but varying perspectives. Reports from past Conversations are available at [www.canada.metropolis.net](http://www.canada.metropolis.net).

#### About Metropolis

The Metropolis Project is an international forum for comparative research and policy development on migration, integration and diversity. Metropolis aims to enhance academic research capacity, encourage policy-relevant research, and develop ways to facilitate the use of research in decision-making.

The Project involves governments, universities, international organizations and the non-governmental sector and is a

was divided into four sections addressing the following questions: What do we know about the determinants of the economic outcomes of immigrants in general? Which of these determinants most affect outcomes in Canada? Which of these determinants are susceptible to policy intervention? What needs to be done and who should be involved?

### **WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT THE DETERMINANTS OF THE ECONOMIC OUTCOMES OF IMMIGRANTS IN GENERAL?**

The first topic discussed by the Conversation participants was the general determinants of the economic outcomes of immigrants. Participants highlighted the importance of education, language and other characteristics of the immigrants. However, some participants emphasized that the discussion should not focus solely on the characteristics of the immigrants since the characteristics of a host nation also play an important role in determining the labour market outcomes of immigrants. Return migration and the characteristics of the sending country were also discussed as possible influences on economic outcomes.

#### **Characteristics of the Immigrant**

- Human capital is a significant determinant of labour market success. Participants agreed that highly-skilled immigrants tend to perform better than lower-skilled immigrants. Education and work experience are both important aspects of human capital. However, participants noted that the value of both of these aspects of human capital depends on how well they are recognized by employers in the host country. Language skills were also cited as being influential on labour market outcomes with immigrants who are proficient in the dominant language tending to have better outcomes.
- Conversation participants also thought that age could affect an immigrant's labour market performance. Immigrating at a younger age tends to have a positive effect on labour market outcomes. Although older immigrants will have had more time to acquire foreign work experience and education, the usefulness of this experience and education will depend on the recognition of their credentials.
- Participants also suggested that the presence of a familial link in Canada may improve immigrants' economic outcomes. Research suggests that networks play a key role in the economic integration of immigrants, although some suggest that broad, heterogeneous networks with links outside the immigrant's immediate familial circle will have the greatest benefit.

#### **Characteristics of the Host Country**

- Participants suggested that qualified immigrants might experience difficulties receiving recognition for educational credentials and/or foreign work experiences. This problem may vary by host country. For example, Australia tests potential immigrants before they come to Australia to ensure that they meet basic standards. These tests ensure that the skills of immigrants will be recognized in Australia, reducing uncertainty for both immigrants and employers resulting in an increase in economic performance.

- The participants generally agreed that immigrants might also face discrimination, especially if they belong to a cultural or ethnic minority group.
- Macro conditions were also cited as having a strong effect on the labour market performance of immigrants. If an immigrant lands during a period of economic expansion in the host country, it was believed that he/she might have an easier time finding employment that is suitable to his/her skill set. Conversely, if an immigrant arrives during a recession, the immigrant may experience more difficulties finding work or adequate employment.

### **Return Migration**

- The possibility that migrants may leave the host country and return to the sending country or immigrate to another country was also discussed. It was suggested that this might affect the average performance of immigrants in the host country if emigration does not occur randomly. If unsuccessful immigrants have a higher propensity to leave, then the average earnings of immigrants will rise. Conversely if stronger immigrants are more likely to leave the host country, then the average earnings of immigrants will fall. Some immigrants who do not succeed in the host country are not able to return to the country of origin, such as refugees. Immigrants who do not succeed in the labour market of the host country may also not be able to return if they used all their assets to migrate to the host country. Immigrants who succeed may be more able to afford emigration.

### **Characteristics of the Sending Country**

- One participant remarked that the characteristics of the sending country may have an impact on the immigrant's labour market outcome by affecting the immigrant's incentives. It was suggested that for a given probability of return to the country of origin, immigrants from sending countries with lower wages may exert more effort and may have a higher propensity to save. The relative wage between the host and sending country can also affect effort. If the wage in the sending country is rising relative to the wage in the host country, this might decrease the cost of return and may reduce the effort exerted by an immigrant.
- The quality of education and work experience of the sending country was also seen as impacting the labour market outcomes of immigrants. It was thought that immigrants from countries with better educational systems should perform better in the labour market of the host country.

### **WHICH OF THESE DETERMINANTS MOST AFFECT OUTCOMES IN CANADA?**

In the second part of the Conversation, the discussion focused on the determinants that most affect outcomes of immigrants in Canada. Many of the determinants overlapped the determinants discussed in the first part of the Conversation. As with the discussion on the determinants of the economic outcomes of immigrants in general, the discussion of the aspects affecting outcomes in Canada focused on the characteristics of the immigrants

and of the host country, including difficulties with credential recognition, change of source countries, discrimination and language difficulties.

### **Human Capital**

- The Conversation participants generally believed that immigrants from higher-skill groups have tended to do better in Canada. However, immigrants from non-traditional countries tended to have difficulties receiving recognition for the skills they acquired in the country of origin. There has been a large decline in returns to foreign work experience (see Green and Worswick (2003), Schaafsma and Sweetman (2001) and Hum and Simpson (1999)). It was pointed out that this decline is correlated with source country. Immigrants from non-traditional source countries experienced no returns to work experience. Another problem that participants believed that immigrants might face, especially those from non-traditional source countries, is the problem of having school credentials recognized (Li, 2001). It was suggested that it is difficult for employers to be able to determine the quality of credentials from countries and institutions with which they are unfamiliar.
- Education was also discussed. Participants agreed that immigrants who received their education in Canada performed very well in the labour market. If they came to Canada at a younger age, there is only a small economic disadvantage. It was also noted that the age of immigration influences the acquisition of education with immigrants who come to Canada in their early to mid-teens being more likely to obtain fewer years of education (Schaafsma and Sweetman, 2001).
- Is the lack of recognition of foreign skills a source of discrimination or is it due to differences in human capital? Some participants highlighted that immigrants who come from countries with low test scores on international tests (based on math and science) are more likely to have lower returns to education in Canada. If they immigrated to Canada at a young age, the test scores of the home country are less influential, indicating that it is the quality of education in the source country and not other source country characteristics driving these empirical findings.
- It was also noted that while there was a return to education for immigrants, highly-educated immigrants still saw an increase in the earnings gap relative to the Canadian born.
- A larger percentage of immigrants come from countries where English and French are not spoken, or are not the dominant languages. Many participants thought that since immigrants from these countries may not be fluent in Canada's official languages they may experience more difficulty finding employment.
- One participant observed that in Quebec, an extra premium is placed on an immigrant's knowledge of French. However, this lowers the importance placed on other aspects of human capital. Further it was remarked that English is still important for labour market success in Quebec.

- It was mentioned that policy changes have led to a shift in the composition of immigrant classes over the period of economic decline of immigrant cohorts. For example, the proportion of immigrants coming from the independent class dropped from 70 percent in 1973 to 20 percent in 1992 (Green, 1999). The change in immigration policy has also led to a decrease in the human capital flows to Canada (Coulson and DeVoretz, 1993)

### Family Immigration

- With the increasing proportion of family class immigrants admitted to Canada over the past few decades, their economic outcomes have become increasingly important. However, immigrants from the family class have had difficulty integrating into the Canadian labour market. While immigrants from the family reunification class are not admitted based on economic criteria, participants highlighted that immigrants from this group still enter the labour force. Similar concerns were raised about refugees.

### Discrimination

- With an increasing percentage of immigrants coming from visible minority groups and non-traditional sending countries, discrimination was cited as another potential explanation for the deterioration of labour market outcomes (Pendakur and Pendakur, 1998).
- It was also observed that discrimination might not always be conscious. Differences in terms of workplace practices or misunderstandings based on cultural cues may impede the progress of qualified immigrants.
- Empirical evidence shows that even Canadian-born minorities face a large earnings disadvantage relative to Canadian-born non-visible minorities. Between 1991 and 1996, the earnings gap between white and visible-minority Canadian-born men doubled (Pendakur and Pendakur, 2002). Some participants emphasized that the Canadian-born have no accent and would have likely received their education in Canada, so they should not face any credential recognition problems; earnings differentials may, therefore, be largely due to discrimination.
- However not everyone was in agreement that discrimination could explain the large drop in relative earnings. Some members argued that it is hard to assert that there has been a surge in discrimination over the period in which the labour market outcomes of immigrants worsened. It was suggested that it is more likely that the Canadian labour market could not absorb the volume of immigrants during the 1990s. Also it was noted that the decline in labour market outcomes is not particular to immigrants. In the 1990s, even Canadian-born workers experienced a downward shift in the age-earnings profile of new entrants to the labour market (see Frenette and Morissette (2003) and Green and Worswick (2003)).

## **Entry Conditions**

- Participants agreed that the macro conditions present at the time of arrival of immigrants could have a strong effect on the labour market performance of immigrants. With the economic slow down in the 1990s, there was little net job creation making it a difficult period to arrive in Canada. If immigrants have difficulty finding work in occupations related to their education and foreign work experience, participants believed that the value of the immigrants' credentials might deteriorate.

## **Disappearance**

- Some participants mentioned that more skilled immigrants have a higher propensity to leave Canada or at least disappear from submitting tax returns. Evidence from the IMDB suggests that the highly-skilled immigrants have a higher propensity to disappear from filing taxes. This causes a downward shift in the average skill level of immigrants in Canada, lowering average earnings.

## **WHICH OF THESE DETERMINANTS ARE SUSCEPTIBLE TO POLICY INTERVENTION?**

The third segment of the Conversation focused on identifying the determinants that could be best affected by policy. The Conversation largely centered on policies that would guarantee that immigrants have the skills necessary for success in the Canadian labour market and ensure that there are no labour market impediments inhibiting immigrants from reaching their potential. Conversation participants mentioned the following determinants as being susceptible to policy intervention:

### **Credential Recognition**

- It was thought that policy could be modified to ensure that qualified immigrants are able to get their credentials recognized.

### **Alter Levels**

- The level of immigration could be modified to reflect economic conditions. Some Conversation participants recommended that the level of immigration could be altered to bring in the number of immigrants that the labour market can absorb.

### **Change Flow of Immigrants**

- It was also suggested that policy could be used to divert the flow of immigration from regions and cities that have an excess supply of labour to areas that have a labour or skill shortage.

## **Alter Composition**

- Participants agreed that the composition of immigrants could be altered in order to bring in the type of immigrants that will prosper and that will not become a financial drain on Canadian society. Immigrant characteristics such as age, class composition and skill distribution could be reexamined when determining the point system. In addition, well-being and economic ability, not only of primary members but also of family members, needs to be considered.
- Further, it was suggested that the composition of immigrants could be modified to better reflect the needs of the Canadian labour market. If a certain skill set is not needed, the point system could be changed to reflect this.
- It was generally agreed that the government could attract the best and brightest immigrants by being more proactive in recruiting immigrants.

## **Public Perceptions of Immigrants**

- Participants thought that the negative perception of immigrants held by the public was susceptible to policy.

The discussion on the determinants that were susceptible to policies thus focused on implementing policies that would guarantee that the skills of immigrants matched those needed by the Canadian labour market, ensure that the credentials of the immigrants be recognized and reduce other impediments to economic success.

## **WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE & WHO SHOULD BE INVOLVED?**

In the final section, participants discussed what should be done and who should be involved in reversing the trend of declining outcomes of immigrants. It was noted that the number of immigrants currently admitted to Canada is not based on any economic rationale and is instead based on political considerations. Many of the recommendations emphasized altering the point system to admit immigrants who are most likely to be successful and fill the needs of the Canadian labour market. The role of the private sector under an employer-nominated system was also discussed.

## **Education and Language Skills**

- Immigrants tend to have trouble finding jobs in the Canadian labour market. There has been an increase in the proportion of Canadian-born students with university degrees while at the same time the proportion of immigrants with university degrees has also increased. Many participants thought that this floods the labour market with people who possess similar skill sets, making it difficult for immigrants with university degrees to find rewarding employment.

- Immigration should be used to fill needs in the economy. Many participants thought that the point system currently places too much emphasis on university education and that there is a deficit of trade skills in Canada. It was recommended that the education qualifications be broadened to include trade/college education to ensure a diversified labour force. Immigrants could receive points for having trade skills that fill this void.
- Generally, participants agreed that immigrants should act as complements to the Canadian labour force and not as substitutes. It was also remarked that it is important that immigrants do not displace the Canadian-born from job opportunities, especially in fields with premiums such as in the medical field. Otherwise, negative sentiments towards immigrants may increase.
- Some participants recommended that the point system better reflect the importance and transferability of credentials to the Canadian labour. If an immigrant is receiving points for having a certain level of education, it is important that the education be accredited in Canada.
- Several of the participants advised that the point system should give a higher emphasis to young, working age immigrants. Older immigrants are not as successful in the labour market (De Silva, 1997). Further, they have a shorter work horizon and may become a net drain on social programs when they retire.
- While language skills are important, language was not seen as being equally important for every type of employment. Most jobs requiring a university degree demand strong language skills. However, trade jobs, such as carpentry, do not rely heavily on a strong knowledge of Canada's official languages. Participants thought that the point system should reflect this fact by requiring strong language skills only for those trained in fields that require these skills.

### **Adjust Level of Immigrants**

- Can Canada absorb the number of immigrants that it currently takes in? Participants thought that we needed to ensure that the Canadian labour market is able to absorb the number of immigrants it is currently admitting. Immigrants might have better outcomes if there is not an excess supply of immigrants admitted. In that case, immigrants might find it easier to locate suitable employment. Further, some participants emphasized that Canada cannot keep bringing in large numbers of immigrants if they continue to do poorly.
- Immigration is concentrated in a few large urban centers. Some thought that immigrants would benefit economically if immigration were more evenly distributed. Immigrants often perform better in small towns. However, one participant pointed out that immigrants are only likely to go to a small town if they already have employment there. Another participant felt that it is ill-advised to force immigrants to go to small towns where the necessary social support networks may not be present.

- If we had brought fewer immigrants in during the 1990s, it was suggested that this would probably have had little effect on earnings but may have reduced the number of unemployed immigrants in Canada. Empirical evidence finds only a small negative effect on wages from an increase in the supply of immigrants (for example, see Friedberg and Hunt (1995) and Card (2001)). However, some at the table emphasized that there may still be a drain on public finances and a decrease in Canada's overall economic performance if a large number of immigrants find themselves unemployed or underemployed.
- Some participants stressed that a decrease in the level of immigration may not be reasonable. Immigrants currently compose 70 percent of labour market growth. Further, there will be a large proportion of the current workforce retiring in the next 10 to 15 years. Also, with the low birth rate in Canada, the population will start to decline by 2015. However, there was no consensus on whether managing the population or labour force based on immigration is necessarily the best or only possible mechanism. It was noted that immigration is only one tool to manage the labour needs of Canada. In addition, it was determined that other members of society need to become more involved in the labour market. For example, the skills of some groups, such as Aboriginals and single parents, are currently underutilized.
- Participants emphasized the importance of business cycles in determining absorption levels. Business cycles are known to have large effects on immigrant outcomes, both in the short and long run (see McDonald and Worswick (1997) and McDonald and Worswick (1998)). Immigrants who are brought in during poor economic times are less likely to succeed. While it is impossible to fully smooth business cycle fluctuations, it was suggested that immigration policies could be used to minimize the adverse effects of recessions on the outcomes of immigrants. In times of recession, when unemployment rates are high and/or rising, the labour market cannot absorb as many immigrants, and the number of immigrants admitted could be reduced. In periods of expansion, when the economy has reached or is heading towards a high level of capacity utilization and low unemployment rate, the number of immigrants admitted could be increased. However, it was noted that the coordination of immigration flows with business cycles may be problematic. Recessions are usually of short duration, and it is difficult to instantly change the level of immigrants admitted.

### Family Immigration

Concern was raised about the well-being of immigrants admitted under the family class. Participants thought that focus should be placed on improving the well-being and economic integration of all immigrants, including family class. Participants highlighted that sponsored family members do not have to meet any criteria other than health and character. *[Editor's note: However, sponsors of family class immigrants must agree to financially support sponsored relatives for a specified period, which ranges from three to 10 years.]* Some suggested that if the composition of the family class was expanded to include brothers and sisters, for example, a language requirement should be considered.

Concerns were also raised about health care or social assistance costs that may stem from older sponsored family members, especially if sponsors cannot meet their obligations. Empirical evidence shows that although there is a lower proportion of elderly immigrants relative to the elderly Canadian-born, elderly immigrants nonetheless represent a drain on government programs (Baker and Benjamin, 2002). Participants agreed that immigrants should have to be self-sufficient and should not place any undue stress on government programs.

Currently, the objectives of the existing immigration policy include humanitarian reasons, family reunification and economic reasons. While we cannot change the humanitarian criteria due to international obligations, many participants stressed that a greater emphasis should be placed on admitting immigrants who will be self-sufficient and successful in the labour market.

### **Public Education**

- In order to change the public's stereotypes about immigrants it was suggested that the government could be more proactive in informing the public of the benefits that immigrants provide.

### **Attracting the Best Talent**

- To ensure that Canada attracts the best talent, many participants agreed that Canada should be the first to entice potential migrants from countries that have recently opened up their borders. Canada needs to “cream off” the best immigrants before other countries attract these highly skilled potential migrants.
- Another recommendation was to increase the retention rate of foreign students in Canada. This would also eliminate the problem of credential recognition faced by many immigrants who obtain their education in a foreign country.
- Many participants thought that immigrants could be better informed of their chances of success in Canada before they arrive. Many immigrants come here with misperceptions. It was proposed that Canada could follow Australia's model of assessing skills overseas.

### **Entry Fee**

- The possibility of a fee placed on immigrants coming to Canada was also discussed. It was suggested that an entry fee would encourage immigrants to thoroughly investigate the opportunities in Canada and assess the likelihood of labour market success. This might discourage the immigration of those with a lower probability of labour market success. Some participants were not in support of an extra fee contending that the fee would be more hurtful for immigrants from countries with low standards of living. Also, the desire to immigrate to Canada may outweigh the cost of the entry fee, even if the probability of labour market success is low. It thus may not be a deterrent, even for those who may not experience labour market success.

## Language Training

- With participants highlighting the importance of language skills, it was proposed that both the government and private sector could be more proactive in ensuring that immigrants have proper language training.

## Employer Nomination

- The government tries to attract immigrants with skills they believe the labour market requires. However, employers are often better equipped than the government to determine the skills they require. Some members at the table expected that immigrants who are sponsored by employers would experience fewer obstacles to integrating into the labour market, as they would be chosen for their combination of skills and experience not readily available in Canada.

- While most participants were in agreement about the potential merits of an employer-nominated system, some concerns did surface. It was remarked that there may be conflicting interests between the government and a firm's choice of immigrants. The private goals of employers do not always equate to the social needs of society. Employers have shorter time horizons than does the government. Employers try to maximize profit, which does not always guarantee the long-term employment of workers.

- Which agent is responsible for immigrants brought in under an employer-nomination system who are not successful in the labour market? If a worker is laid off, does the employer have a responsibility for the immigrant's welfare, or does the government assume the responsibility? It was agreed that the employer would need to take some of the responsibility. One solution mentioned was to force the employer to guarantee employment for a certain period of time. However, employers may be reluctant to bring over immigrants if they have to ensure employment for a long period of time. Further, if they have to provide guaranteed employment to immigrants they bring over, in times of a recession it may be the Canadian born and non-employer nominated immigrants who will be laid off, creating an unwanted result.

- Another concern was that employers might have a higher propensity to choose from countries with which they are more familiar. Allowing employers to choose immigrants may, as a result, reduce the number of source countries.

- It was proposed that a system where extra points are given to employer-nominated immigrants instead of allowing the acceptance of an immigrant to be fully decided by prospective employers would reduce potential problems.

- Another option was raised. It was suggested that temporary-work visas could be granted to ensure that unsuccessful immigrants do not become a financial drain. However, German Green Cards have not worked well in Germany, with employers finding the administration costs too much of a burden. It was also noted that creating successful permanent citizens is an important objective of immigration policy.

There were several suggestions on how to improve the economic outcomes of immigrants. Participants saw a role for both the public and private sector in ameliorating the outcomes of immigrants. The government could target levels based on economic consideration, be more proactive at attracting top quality immigrants and change the type of immigrant admitted to better reflect the needs of the Canadian labour market. Many participants thought that the private firms could play a larger role in choosing immigrants to fill labour market voids.

The need for future research was also discussed. It was thought that research on the determinants of immigrant outcomes could be enhanced by examining why overachievers were successful. Participants also thought that broadening the cross-country comparison would be beneficial in order to determine which policies were successful in other countries in attracting immigrants who had labour market success and which policies failed.

## **REFERENCES**

- Baker, M. and D. Benjamin (1994) "The performance of immigrants in the Canadian labour market", *Journal of Labor Economics* 12: 369-405.
- Baker, M. and D. Benjamin (2002) "Are elderly immigrants a burden?", Canadian Immigration Policy for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century conference, Kingston Ontario, October
- Beach, C. and C. Worswick (1993) "Is there a Double-Negative Effect on the Earnings of Immigrant Women?", *Canadian Public Policy* 19(1): 36-53.
- Bloom, D.E., G. Grenier and M. Gunderson (1995) "The changing labour market position of Canadian immigrants", *Canadian Journal of Economics* 28: 987-1005.
- Card, D. (2001) "Immigrant Inflows, Native Outflows, and the Local Market Impacts of Higher Immigration", *Journal of Labor Economics*, 19(1): 22-64.
- Coulson R.G. and D.J. DeVoretz (1993) "Human Capital Content of Canadian Immigrants: 1967-1987", *Canadian Public Policy* 19(4): 357-366.
- De Silva, A. (1997) "Earnings of Immigrant Classes in the Early 1980s in Canada: A Reexamination", *Canadian Public Policy* 23(2): 179-199.
- Frenette, M. and R. Morissette (2003) "Will they ever converge? Earning of immigrant and Canadian-born workers over the last two decades", Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series 11F0019MIE No. 215, Analytical studies, Ottawa: Statistics Canada
- Friedberg, R. M. and J. Hunt (1995) "The Impact of Immigrants on Host Country Wages, Employment and Growth", *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 9(2): 23-44.
- Green, D.A. (1999) "Immigrant Occupational Attainment: Assimilation and Mobility over Time", *Journal of Labor Economics*, 17(1), 49-77.

- Green, D.A. and C. Worswick (2003) "Immigrant Earnings Profiles in the Presence of Human Capital Investment: Measuring Cohort and Macro Effects", Society of Labor Economists Conference, Toronto, Canada, September.
- Hum, D. and W. Simpson (1999) "Wage Opportunities for Visible Minorities in Canada", *Canadian Public Policy* 25 (3): 379-394.
- Li, Peter S. (2001) "The Market Worth of Immigrants' Educational Credentials", *Canadian Public Policy* 25 (1): 23-38.
- McDonald, J.T. and C. Worswick (1997) "Unemployment Incidence of Immigrant Men in Canada", *Canadian Public Policy* 23(4) 353-373.
- McDonald, J.T. and C. Worswick (1998) "The Earnings of Immigrant Men in Canada: Job Tenure, Cohort, and Macroeconomic Conditions", *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* 51(3): 465-482.
- Picot, G. and F. Hou (2003) "The rise in low-income rates among immigrants in Canada" Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series 11F0019MIE No. 198, Analytical studies, Ottawa: Statistics Canada
- Pendakur, K. and R. Pendakur (2002) "Colour My World: Have Earnings Gaps for Canadian-Born Ethnic Minorities Changed Over Time?", *Canadian Public Policy* 28 (4): 489-511.
- Pendakur, K. and R. Pendakur (1998) "The colour of money: earning differentials among ethnic groups in Canada", *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 31, 518-548.
- Schaafsma, J. and A. Sweetman (2001) "Immigrant earnings: age at immigration matters", *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 34 (4):1066-1099.
- Statistics Canada, (2003) "The changing profile of Canada's labour force." *The Daily*, Catalogue No 11-001-XIE, Tuesday, February 11, 2003.

***This Conversation was a partnership between the Metropolis Project and Human Resources and Skills Development Canada***

## APPENDIX 1: HANDOUT GIVEN TO PARTICIPANTS

### LABOUR MARKET OUTCOMES FOR IMMIGRANTS

December 2, 2003

Recent immigrants to Canada are, generally speaking, less well off economically than what we have traditionally come to expect. Their poverty levels are higher, it is taking longer for them to see their incomes reach Canadian averages, and they are often employed in positions well below those that they had aspired to in coming to Canada. Recent evidence from Citizenship and Immigration Canada and from the 2001 Census detail this less than happy story.

This Metropolis Conversation will try to determine why we are seeing these results. It will, to this end, try to identify the causal determinants that underlie these developments, both those that apply generally to migrants regardless of their country of destination and those that are specific to Canada. Finally, we will discuss the extent to which these determinants are susceptible to government policy intervention, whether some policies might inadvertently hinder immigrants from attaining economic success, and what policy decisions ought to be considered to improve this situation.

As we proceed, we will ask whether the careful selection of immigrants matters to economic outcomes in the ways that we have hoped, whether education, language, age, experience, or country of origin matter and to what degree? Do selected immigrants do better than those who are not selected, such as those who come to be reunited with their families or who have come to Canada for protection? If so, what are the specific factors that lead to this result? Does length of stay matter? Do those who are temporary or seasonal workers fare differently from those who apply for permanent residence and, subsequently, citizenship?

To what extent are their economic fortunes the result of the actions of the immigrants themselves? How can they influence their own destinies? How do we understand the phenomena of the overachiever and what can we learn from their successes? To what extent are these outcomes in the control of the employers, of licensing authorities, of governments? To what extent are societal effects such as the state of the economy, the particularities of the labour market, or the presence of discrimination at play?

Our hope is to reach not only specific conclusions about the situation in Canada but also to arrive at some generalizations about economic outcomes of migrants based on economic theory as well as on survey and census data and on other evidence from Canadian and non-Canadian experience. If some of these effects are general, it will help us to better understand the Canadian experience and to better search for remedies to a situation that no one wants to see continue. This Conversation will involve leading migration economists from Canada and abroad, Canadian policy makers, and representatives from Canadian think tanks. An analytical report will receive wide circulation following the event.